

# ULAM–HYERS–MITTAG-LEFFLER STABILITY FOR FRACTIONAL-ORDER DELAY DIFFERENTIAL EQUATIONS

P.S.Deepa<sup>1\*</sup> and M.Angayarkanni<sup>2</sup>

<sup>a\*</sup>Research Scholar ,Department of Mathematics Kandaswami Kandars College ,  
P.Velur, Tamil Nadu,India

<sup>b</sup>Research Supervisor, Department of Mathematics ,Kandaswamy Kandars College  
,P.Velur, Tamil Nadu,India

Email id: <sup>1</sup>deepas.dhana@gmail.com, <sup>2</sup>angayarkanni66@rediffmail.com

## **Abstarct**

*In this paper, we present results on the existence, uniqueness, and Ulam–Hyers–Mittag-Leffler stability of solutions to a class of fractional-order delay differential equations. We use the Picard operator method and a generalized Gronwall inequality involved in Riemann–Liouville fractiona lintegral .Finally, we give two examples to illustrate our main theorems.*

## **Keywords**

*Fractional-order delay differential equations; Solutions; Existence; Stability.*

## **1. Introduction**

Fractional-order differential equations are important since the ir non local property is suit-able to characterize memory phenomena in economic, control, and materials sciences. Existence, stability, and control theory to fractional differential equations was investigated in[1–21].In particular, the Ulam-type stability of delay differential equations was investigated in[22–30]. In[22], results for a delay differential equation were obtained using the Picard operator method, and in[23] the authors adopted a similar approach to establish the existence and uniqueness results for a Caputo-type fractional-order delay differential equation. In[31,32],the authors gave stability and numerical schemes for two classes of fractional equations.So usaand Oliveira[33] proposed the  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional differentiation operator and established  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional differential equations. In[24] the authors studied the Ulam–Hyers stability and the Ulam–Hyers–Rassias stability of  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional integro-differential equations via the Banach fixed point method, and in [28] the author discussed the existence and uniqueness of

solutions and Ulam–Hyers and Ulam–Hyers–Rassias stabilities for  $\psi$ -Hilfer nonlinear fractional differential equations via a generalized Gronwall inequality (see [34]).

Motivated by [23, 24, 28], we consider the  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional differential equation

$$\begin{cases} {}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi} x(\tau) = f(\tau, x(\tau), x(g(\tau))), & \tau \in I = (0, d], \\ I_{0^+}^{1-\gamma;\psi} x(0^+) = x_0 \in \mathbb{R}, \\ x(\tau) = \varphi(\tau), & \tau \in [-h, 0], \end{cases} \quad (1)$$

where  ${}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi}(\cdot)$  is the  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional derivative (see Definition 2.1) of order  $0 < \alpha \leq 1$  and type

$0 < \beta \leq 1$ ,  $I_{0^+}^{1-\gamma;\psi}(\cdot)$  is the Riemann-Liouville fractional integral of order  $1 - \gamma$ ,  $\gamma = \alpha + \beta(1 - \alpha)$  with respect to the function  $\psi$  (see [2], and  $f: I \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is a given function.

We establish the existence and uniqueness of solutions for (1) using the Picard operator approach in a weight function space. We also introduce and present Ulam-Hyers-Mittag-Leffler stability of solutions to (1).

## 2. Preliminaries

We collect the basic definitions of the  $\psi$ -Riemann-Liouville fractional integral, the  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional derivative, and the standard Picard operator and an abstract Gronwall lemma.

Let  $[c, d]$  ( $0 < c < d < \infty$ ) be a finite interval on  $\mathbb{R}^+$ , and let  $C[c, d]$  be the space of continuous function  $g: [c, d] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  with norm

$$\|g\|_{C[c,d]} = \max_{c \leq x \leq d} |g(x)|.$$

The weighted space  $C_{1-\gamma;\psi}[c, d]$  of continuous  $g$  on  $(c, d]$  is defined by (see [24])

$$C_{1-\gamma;\psi}[c, d] = \left\{ g: (c, d] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}; (\psi(x) - \psi(c))^{1-\gamma} g(x) \in C[c, d] \right\}, \quad 0 \leq \gamma < 1,$$

with norm

$$\|g\|_{C_{1-\gamma;\psi}[c, d]} = \max_{x \in [c, d]} |(\psi(x) - \psi(c))^{1-\gamma} g(x)|.$$

or

$$\|g\|_B := \max_{\tau \in [c, d]} |(\psi(\tau) - \psi(c))^{1-\gamma} g(\tau) e^{-\theta(\psi(\tau) - \psi(c))}, \quad \theta > 0.$$

**Definition 2.1**

Let  $(c,d)(-\infty \leq c < d \leq \infty)$  be a finite or infinite interval of the real line  $\mathbb{R}$ , and let  $\alpha > 0$ . In addition, let  $\psi(x)$  be an increasing and positive monotone function on  $(c,d]$  having a continuous derivative  $\psi'(x)$  on  $(c,d)$ . The left- and right-sided fractional integrals of a function  $g$  with respect to a function  $\psi$  on  $[c,d]$  are defined by

$$I_{c^+}^{\alpha;\psi} g(x) = \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_c^x \psi'(\tau) (\psi(x) - \psi(\tau))^{\alpha-1} g(\tau) dt,$$

$$I_{d^-}^{\alpha;\psi} g(x) = \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_x^d \psi'(\tau) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(x))^{\alpha-1} g(\tau) dt,$$

Respectively; here  $\Gamma$  is the gamma function.

**Definition 2.2**

Let  $n - 1 < \alpha < n$  with  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and let  $f, \psi \in C^n[c, d]$  be two functions such that  $\psi$  is increasing and  $\psi'(x) \neq 0$  for all  $x \in [c, d]$ . The left-side  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional derivative  ${}^H\mathbb{D}_{c^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi}(\cdot)$  of a function  $g$  of order  $\alpha$  and type  $0 \leq \beta \leq 1$  is defined by

$${}^H\mathbb{D}_{c^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi} g(x) = I_{c^+}^{\beta(n-\alpha);\psi} \left( \frac{1}{\psi'(x)} \frac{d}{dx} \right)^n I_{c^+}^{(1-\beta)(n-\alpha);\psi} g(x).$$

The right-sided  $\psi$ -Hilfer fractional derivative is defined in an analogous way.

**Theorem 2.3**

If  $g \in C^1[c, d]$ ,  $0 < c < 1$ , and  $0 \leq \beta \leq 1$ , then

$$I_{c^+}^{\alpha;\psi} {}^H\mathbb{D}_{c^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi} g(x) = g(x) - \frac{((\psi(x) - \psi(c))^{\gamma-1})}{\Gamma(\gamma)} I_{c^+}^{(1-\beta)(n-\alpha);\psi} g(c).$$

Let  $I = [c, d]$ . For  $f \in C(I \times \mathbb{R}^2, \mathbb{R})$  and  $\epsilon > 0$ , we consider the equations

$${}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi} x(\tau) = f(\tau, x(\tau), x(g(\tau))), \quad \tau \in (0, d], \tag{2}$$

$$I_{0^+}^{1-\gamma;\psi} x(0^+) = x_0, \tag{3}$$

$$x(\tau) = \varphi(\tau), \quad \tau \in [-h, 0], \tag{4}$$

and the inequality

$$\left| {}^H\mathbb{D}_{c^+}^{\alpha,\beta;\psi} x(\tau) - f(\tau, x(\tau), x(g(\tau))) \right| \leq \epsilon E_\alpha (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha, \quad \tau \in (0, d], \tag{5}$$

where  $E_\alpha$  is the Mittag - Leffler function [2] defined by

$$E_\alpha(x) := \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \frac{x^i}{\Gamma(i\alpha + 1)}, \quad x \in \mathbb{C}, \Re(\alpha) > 0. \quad (6)$$

Motivated by [23, Lemma 2.4], we introduce the following concept.

### Definition 2.5

Equation (2) is Ulam–Hyers–Mittag–Leffler stable with respect to  $E_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha)$  if there exists  $cE_\alpha > 0$  such that, for each  $\varepsilon > 0$  and each solution  $y \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$  to (5), there exists a solution  $x \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$  to (2) with

$$|y(\tau) - x(\tau)| \leq cE_\alpha \varepsilon E_\alpha(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha, \quad \tau \in [-h, d],$$

### Remark 2.6

A function  $x \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$  is a solution of inequality (5) if and only if there exists a function  $\tilde{h} \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$  (which depends on  $x$ ) such that

$$(i) \quad |\tilde{h}(\tau)| \leq \varepsilon E_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha), \quad \tau \in [-h, d],$$

$$(ii) \quad {}^H\mathbb{D}_0^{\alpha, \beta; \psi} x(\tau) = f(\tau, x(\tau), x(g(\tau))) + \tilde{h}(\tau), \quad \tau \in (0, d]$$

### Definition 2.7

Let  $(Y, \rho)$  be a metric space. Now  $T: Y \rightarrow Y$  is a Picard operator if there exists

$y^* \in Y$  such that

$$(i) \quad F_T = y^* \text{ where } F_T = \{y \in Y : T(y) = y\} \text{ is the fixed point set of } T;$$

$$(ii) \quad \text{the sequence } (T^n(y_0))_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \text{ converges to } y^* \text{ for all } y_0 \in Y.$$

### Lemma 2.8

Let  $(Y, \rho, \leq)$  be an ordered metric space, and let  $T: Y \rightarrow Y$  be an increasing Picard operator with  $F_T = \{y_T^*\}$ . Then  $y \in Y$ ,  $y \leq T(y)$  implies  $y \leq y_T^*$ .

From Theorems 2.3 and 2.4 we have the following:

### Lemma 2.9

Let  $f: I \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a continuous function. Then (2) is equivalent to

$$x(\tau) = \frac{((\psi(x) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} x_0 + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, x(s), x(g(s))) ds. \quad (7)$$

**Remark 2.10**

Let  $y \in C(I, \mathbb{R})$  be a solution of inequality (5). Then  $y$  is a solution of the following integral inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} & \left| y(\tau) - \frac{((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 - \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \right| \\ & \leq \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \mathbb{E}_\alpha (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^\alpha ds \\ & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{k\alpha}}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} ds \\ & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} \int_0^\tau (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{k\alpha} d\psi(s) \\ & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} \int_0^{\psi(\tau) - \psi(0)} (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0) - u)^{\alpha-1} u^{k\alpha} du \end{aligned}$$

(let  $u = \psi(s) - \psi(0)$ )

$$\begin{aligned} & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\alpha-1} \int_0^{\psi(\tau) - \psi(0)} \left(1 - \frac{u}{\psi(\tau) - \psi(0)}\right)^{\alpha-1} u^{k\alpha} du \\ & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{(k+1)\alpha} \int_0^1 v^{k\alpha} dv \\ & \quad \left(\text{let } v = \frac{u}{\psi(\tau) - \psi(0)}\right) \\ & = \frac{\varepsilon}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)} (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{(k+1)\alpha} \frac{\Gamma(k\alpha + 1)\Gamma(\alpha)}{\Gamma((k+1)\alpha + 1)} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} &\leq \varepsilon \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{n\alpha}}{\Gamma(n\alpha + 1)} \\ &= \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_{\alpha}(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\alpha} . \end{aligned}$$

**Lemma 2.11**

Let  $\alpha > 0$ , and let  $\psi \in C^1((0, d], \mathbb{R})$  be a function such that  $\psi$  is increasing and  $\psi'(\tau) \neq 0$  for all  $\tau \in (0, d]$ . Suppose that  $d \geq 0, z$  is a nonnegative function locally integrable on  $(0, d]$ , and  $w$  is nonnegative integrable on  $(0, d]$  with

$$w(\tau) \leq z(\tau) + k \int_0^{\tau} \psi'(s)(\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w(s) ds, \quad \tau \in (0, d].$$

Then

$$w(\tau) \leq z(\tau) + \int_0^{\tau} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{[k\Gamma(\alpha)]^n}{\Gamma(n\alpha)} \psi'(s)(\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} z(s) ds, \quad \tau \in (0, d].$$

**Remark 2.12**

Under the hypotheses of Lemma 2.11, let  $z$  be a non decreasing function on  $(0, d]$ . Then we have

$$w(\tau) \leq z(\tau) \mathbb{E}_{\alpha}(k\Gamma(\alpha)[\psi(\tau) - \psi(0)]^{\alpha}), \tau \in (0, d],$$

Where  $\mathbb{E}_{\alpha}$  is the Mittag - Leffler function defined by (6) .

**3. Main results**

In this section, we establish the existence, uniqueness, and Ulam-Hyers-Leffler stability.

We impose the following conditions.

$$(H_1) f \in C(I \times \mathbb{R}^2, \mathbb{R}), g \in C(I, [-h, d]), g(\tau) \leq \tau, h > 0 .$$

(H<sub>2</sub>) There exists  $L_f > 0$  such that

$$|f(\tau, u_1, u_2) - f(\tau, v_1, v_2)| \leq L_f \sum_{i=1}^2 |u_i - v_i| \quad \text{for all } \tau \in I, u_i, v_i \in \mathbb{R}, \quad i = 1, 2 .$$

(H<sub>3</sub>) We have the inequality

$$\frac{2L_f \Gamma(\gamma)(\psi(d) - \psi(0))^{\alpha}}{\Gamma(\gamma + \alpha)} < 1 .$$

**Theorem 3.1**

Assume that  $(H_1)$ ,  $(H_2)$ , and  $(H_3)$  are satisfied. Then

- (i) (2) – (4) has a unique solution in  $C[-h, d] \cap C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[c, d]$ .  
 (ii) (2) is Ulam – Hyers – Mittag – Leffler stable.

**Proof**

From Lemma 2.9 we get that (2) – (4) is equivalent to the following system:

$$y(\tau) = \begin{cases} \varphi(\tau), & \tau \in [-h, 0], \\ \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \\ + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds, & \tau \in (0, d]. \end{cases} \quad (8)$$

The existence of a solution for (8) can be turned into a fixed point problem in  $X := C[-h, d]$  for the operator  $T_f$  defined by

$$T_f(x)(\tau) = \begin{cases} \varphi(\tau), & \tau \in [-h, 0], \\ \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \\ + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds, & \tau \in (0, d]. \end{cases} \quad (9)$$

Note that for any continuous function  $f$ ,  $T_f$  is also continuous. Indeed,

$$|T_f(x)(\tau) - T_f(x)(\tau_0)|$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \left| \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \right. \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) \\
&\quad - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \\
&\quad - \frac{(\psi(\tau_0) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^{\tau_0} \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau_0) \\
&\quad - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \left. \right| \\
&\quad \rightarrow 0
\end{aligned}$$

as  $\tau \rightarrow \tau_0$ .

Next, we show  $T_f$  defined in (9) is a contraction mapping on  $X := C[-h, d]$  with respect to  $\|\cdot\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}$ . Consider  $T_f: X \rightarrow X$  defined in (9). For  $\tau \in [-h, 0]$ , we have

$$|T_f(x)(\tau) - T_f(y)(\tau)| = 0, \quad x, y \in C([-h, 0], \mathbb{R}).$$

For all  $\tau \in (0, d]$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
&|T_f(x)(\tau) - T_f(y)(\tau)| \\
&\leq \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \left| f(s, x(s), x(g(s))) \right. \\
&\quad \left. - f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) \right| ds \\
&\leq \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) \\
&\quad - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} \left\{ (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{1-\gamma} [|x(s) \right. \\
&\quad - y(s)| + |x(g(s) - y(g(s))|] \right\} ds \\
&\leq \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} \\
&\quad \times \left[ \max_{s \in [0, d]} |(\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{1-\gamma} x(s) - y(s)| \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \max_{s \in [0, d]} |(\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{1-\gamma} x(g(s) - y(g(s))| \right] ds
\end{aligned}$$



$$\begin{aligned} &\leq \frac{2L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \|x - y\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) \\ &\quad - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} ds \\ &= \frac{2L_f(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\alpha+\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \frac{\Gamma(\gamma)\Gamma(\alpha)}{\Gamma(\gamma + \alpha)} \|x - y\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}, \end{aligned}$$

Which implies that

$$\begin{aligned} &\|T_f(x) - T_f(y)\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]} \\ &\leq \frac{2L_f\Gamma(\gamma)(\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \|x - y\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}. \end{aligned}$$

Thus  $T_f$  is a contraction (via the norm  $\|\cdot\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}$  on  $X$ ). Now apply the Banach contraction principle to establish (i).

Now we prove (ii). Let  $y \in C[-h, 0] \cap C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]$  be a solution to (2). We denote by  $x \in C[-h, 0] \cap C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]$  the unique solution to problem (i). Now  $\varphi(\tau)$ ,  $\tau \in [-h, 0]$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} &x(\tau) = \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \\ &+ \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds, \quad \tau \in (0, d]. \end{aligned}$$

From Remark 2.10 we have

$$\begin{aligned} &\left| y(\tau) - \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \right| \\ &\leq \varepsilon E_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

for  $\tau \in (0, d]$  and note that  $|y(\tau) - x(\tau)| = 0$  for  $\tau \in [-h, 0]$ .

For all  $\tau \in (0, d]$ , it follows from  $(H_2)$  and (10) that

$$|y(\tau) - x(\tau)|$$

$$\begin{aligned} &\leq \left| y(\tau) - \frac{(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\gamma)} y_0 \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \right| \\ &\quad + \left| \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) ds \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} f(s, x(s), x(g(s))) ds \right| \\ &\leq \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) + \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} [|y(s) - \\ &\quad x(s)| + |y(g(s)) - x(g(s))|] ds. \tag{11} \end{aligned}$$

For all  $w \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R}_+)$ , consider the operator

$$T_1: C([-h, d], \mathbb{R}_+) \rightarrow C([-h, d], \mathbb{R}_+)$$

defined by

$$T_1(w)(\tau) = \begin{cases} 0, & \tau \in [-h, 0] \\ \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \\ \quad + \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w(s) ds \right. \\ \quad \left. + \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w(g(s)) ds \right), & \tau \in (0, d]. \end{cases}$$

We prove that  $T_1$  is a Picard operator. For all  $\tau \in [0, d]$ , it follows from  $(H_2)$  that

$$\begin{aligned} &|T_1(w)(\tau) - T_1(z)(\tau)| \\ &\leq \frac{2L_f \Gamma(\gamma) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^{\alpha+\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \|w - z\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}. \end{aligned}$$

for all  $w, z \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$ . Then we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} &\|T_1(w) - T_1(z)\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]} \\ &\leq \frac{2L_f \Gamma(\gamma) (\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \|w - z\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}. \end{aligned}$$

for all  $w, z \in C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$ . Thus  $T_1$  is a contraction (via the norm  $\|\cdot\|_{C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]}$  on  $C([-h, d], \mathbb{R})$ ).

Applying the Banach contraction principle to  $T_1$ , we see that  $T_1$  is a Picard operator and  $F_{T_1} = w^*$ . Then, for all  $\tau \in [0, d]$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} w^*(\tau) & (= T_1 w^*(\tau)) \\ & = \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \\ & \quad + \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w^*(s) ds \right. \\ & \quad \left. + \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w^*(g(s)) ds \right). \end{aligned}$$

Next, we show that the solution  $w^*$  is increasing. For all  $0 \leq \tau_1 \leq \tau_2 \leq d$  (letting  $m := \min_{s \in [0, d]} [w^*(s) + w^*(g(s))] \in \mathbb{R}_+$ ), we have

$$\begin{aligned} & w^*(\tau_2) - w^*(\tau_1) \\ & = \varepsilon \left[ \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(0))^\alpha) - \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \right] + \\ & \quad \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^{\tau_1} \psi'(s) \left[ (\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} - (\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \right] (w^*(s) + \\ & \quad w^*(g(s))) ds + \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_{\tau_1}^{\tau_2} \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (w^*(s) + w^*(g(s))) ds \\ & \geq \varepsilon \left[ \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(0))^\alpha) - \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \right] \\ & \quad + \frac{mL_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^{\tau_1} \psi'(s) \left[ (\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \right. \\ & \quad \left. - (\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \right] ds \\ & \quad + \frac{mL_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_{\tau_1}^{\tau_2} \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} ds \\ & = \varepsilon \left[ \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(0))^\alpha) - \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \right] \\ & \quad + \frac{mL_f}{\Gamma(\alpha+1)} \left[ (\psi(\tau_2) - \psi(s))^\alpha - (\psi(\tau_1) - \psi(s))^\alpha \right] \\ & > 0. \end{aligned}$$

Thus  $w^*$  is increasing, so  $w^*(g(\tau)) \leq w^*(\tau)$  since  $g(\tau) \leq \tau$  and

$$\begin{aligned} w^*(\tau) & \leq \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \\ & \quad + \frac{2L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} w^*(s) ds. \end{aligned}$$

Using Lemma 2.11 and Remark 2.12, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
w^*(\tau) &\leq \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \mathbb{E}_\alpha(2L_f(\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \quad (\tau \in [0, d]) \\
&\leq \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \mathbb{E}_\alpha(2L_f(\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha) \\
&= {}^c\mathbb{E}_\alpha \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha),
\end{aligned}$$

Where  ${}^c\mathbb{E}_\alpha := \mathbb{E}_\alpha(2L_f(\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha)$ .

In particular, if  $w = |y - x|$ , from (11),  $w \leq T_1 w$  by Lemma 2.8 we obtain  $w \leq w^*$ , where  $T_1$  is an increasing Picard operator. As a result, we get

$$|y(\tau) - x(\tau)| \leq {}^c\mathbb{E}_\alpha \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_\alpha((\psi(\tau) - \psi(0))^\alpha), \quad \tau \in [-h, d],$$

And thus (2) is Ulam - Hyers - Mittag - Leffler stable.

Now we change  $(H_3)$  to

$(H_4)$  We have the inequality

$$\frac{2L_f \Gamma(\alpha) e^{\theta(\psi(d) - \psi(0))} (\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} < 1, \quad \theta > 0.$$

### Theorem 3.2

Assume that  $(H_1)$ ,  $(H_2)$ , and  $(H_4)$  are satisfied. Then

(i) (2) - (4) has a unique solution in  $C[-h, d] \cap C_{1-\gamma; \psi}[0, d]$ .

(ii) (2) is Ulam - Hyers - Mittag - Leffler stable.

Proof

As in Theorem 3.1, we need only prove that  $T_f$  defined as before is a contraction on  $X$  (via the norm  $\|\cdot\|_B$ ). Since the process is standard, we only give the main difference in the proof as follows: For all  $\tau \in (0, d]$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
&|T_f(x)(\tau) - T_f(y)(\tau)| \\
&\leq \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} \left| f(s, x(s), x(g(s))) \right. \\
&\quad \left. - f(s, y(s), y(g(s))) \right| ds
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &\leq \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (|x(s) - y(s)| \\
 &\quad + |x(g(s)) - y(g(s))|) \\
 &\leq \frac{L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} e^{\theta(\psi(s)-\psi(0))} \\
 &\quad \times \{ \max_{0 \leq s \leq d} (\psi(s) - \psi(0))^{1-\gamma} e^{-\theta(\psi(s)-\psi(0))} (|x(s) - y(s)| \\
 &\quad + |x(g(s)) - y(g(s))|) \} ds \\
 &\leq \frac{2L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \|x - y\|_B \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) \\
 &\quad - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} e^{\theta(\psi(s)-\psi(0))} ds \\
 &\leq \frac{2L_f}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \|x - y\|_B e^{\theta(\psi(d)-\psi(0))} \int_0^\tau \psi'(s) (\psi(\tau) - \psi(s))^{\alpha-1} (\psi(s) \\
 &\quad - \psi(0))^{\gamma-1} ds \\
 &\leq \frac{2L_f \Gamma(\alpha) e^{\theta(\psi(d)-\psi(0))} (\psi(d) - \psi(0))^{\alpha+\gamma-1}}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \|x - y\|_B .
 \end{aligned}$$

Then

$$\|T_f(x) - T_f(y)\|_B \leq \frac{2L_f \Gamma(\alpha) e^{\theta(\psi(d)-\psi(0))} (\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \|x - y\|_B .$$

Thus  $T_f$  is a contraction (via the norm  $\| \cdot \|_B$  on  $X$ ).

#### 4. Examples

In this section, we give two examples illustrating our main results.

Example 4.1

Consider the fractional - order system

$$\begin{cases}
 {}_{\mathbb{H}\mathbb{D}}^{\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; e^\tau} x(\tau) = \frac{1}{4} \frac{x^2(\tau-1)}{1+x^2(\tau-1)} + \frac{1}{4} \arctan(x(\tau)), & \tau \in (0, 1], \\
 I_{0^+}^{1-\gamma; e^\tau} x(0^+) \\
 = x_0,
 \end{cases} \tag{12}$$

$$x(\tau) = 0, \tau \in [-h, 0],$$

and the following inequality

$${}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}}; e^\tau x(\tau) - f(\tau, y(\tau), y(\tau - 1)) \leq \varepsilon E_{\frac{1}{2}} \left( (e^\tau - 1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \right).$$

Let  $\alpha = \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $\beta = \frac{1}{2}$ . Then  $\gamma = \alpha + \beta(1 - \alpha) = \frac{3}{4}$ ,  $d = 1, \psi(\cdot) = e, g(\cdot) = \cdot - 1$ ,

$f(\cdot, x(\cdot), g(x(\cdot))) = \frac{1}{4} \frac{x^2(\cdot - 1)}{1 + x^2(\cdot - 1)} + \frac{1}{4} \arctan(x(\cdot))$ , and  $L_f = \frac{1}{4}$ . Thus,

$$\frac{2L_f \Gamma(\alpha)(\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \approx 0.8861 < 1.$$

Now all the assumptions in Theorem 3.1 are satisfied, so problem (12) has a unique solution, and the first equation in (12) is Ulam - Hyers - Mittag - Leffler stable with

$$|y(\tau) - x(\tau)| \leq c_{E_{\frac{1}{2}}} \varepsilon E_{\frac{1}{2}} \left( (e^\tau - 1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \right), \quad \tau \in [-1, 1],$$

where  $c_{E_{\frac{1}{2}}} = E_{\frac{1}{2}} \left( \frac{\sqrt{e-1}}{2} \right)$ .

**Example 4.2**

Consider the fractional - order system

$$\begin{cases} {}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{4}}; \tau^2 x(\tau - 2) = \frac{1}{5} \frac{x^2(\tau - 2)}{1 + x^2(\tau - 2)} + \frac{1}{5} \sin(x(\tau - 2)), & \tau \in (0, 1], \\ I_{0^+}^{1-\gamma; \tau^2} x(0^+) \\ = x_0, \end{cases} \tag{13}$$

$$x(\tau) = 0, \tau \in [-1, 0],$$

and the inequality

$${}^H\mathbb{D}_{0^+}^{\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{4}}; \tau^2 x(\tau) - f(\tau, y(\tau), y(\tau - 1)) \leq \varepsilon E_{\frac{1}{3}} \left( \tau^{\frac{2}{3}} \right).$$

Following Theorem 3.2, Let  $\alpha = \frac{1}{3}$ ,  $\beta = \frac{1}{4}$ . Then  $\gamma = \alpha + \beta(1 - \alpha) = \frac{1}{2}$ . Let

$$d = 1, \quad \theta = \frac{1}{3}, \quad \psi(\cdot) = \tau^2, \quad L_f = \frac{1}{5}. \text{ Thus}$$

$$\frac{2L_f \Gamma(\gamma) e^{\theta(\psi(d) - \psi(0))} (\psi(d) - \psi(0))^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha + \gamma)} \approx 0.8766 < 1.$$

Now all the assumptions in Theorem 3.2 are satisfied, so problem (13)

has a unique solution, and the first equation in (13) is Ulam – Hyers – Mittag – Leffler stable with

$$|y(\tau) - x(\tau)| \leq c_{\mathbb{E}_1} \varepsilon \mathbb{E}_1 \left( \frac{2}{3} \right), \quad \tau \in [-1, 1],$$

where  $c_{\mathbb{E}_1} = \mathbb{E}_1 \left( \frac{2}{5} \right)$ .

## References

1. Podlubny, I.: *Fractional Differential Equations. Mathematics in Science and Engineering*, vol.198. Academic Press, San Diego (1999)
2. Kilbas, A.A., Srivastava, H.M., Trujillo, J.J.: *Theory and Applications of Fractional Differential Equations. Elsevier, Amsterdam* (2006)
3. Abbas, S., Benchohra, M., Darwish, M.A.: *New stability results for partial fractional differential inclusions with not instantaneous impulses. Fract. Calc. Appl. Anal.* 18, 172–191 (2015)
4. Abbas, S., Benchohra, M.: *Uniqueness and Ulam stabilities results for partial fractional differential equations with not instantaneous impulses. Appl. Math. Comput.* 257, 190–198 (2015)
5. Li, M., Wang, J.: *Exploring delayed Mittag Leffler type matrix functions to study finite time stability of fractional delay differentialequations. Appl. Math. Comput.* 324, 254–265 (2018)
6. Liu, S., Wang, J., Zhou, Y., Feckan, M.: *Iterative learning control with pulse compensation for fractional differential equations. Math. Slovaca* 68, 563–574 (2018)
7. Wang, J., Ibrahim, A.G., O'Regan, D.: *Topological structure of the solution set for fractional non-instantaneous mpulsive evolution inclusions. J. Fixed Point Theory Appl.* 20, Article ID 59 (2018)
8. Shah, K., Wang, J., Khalil, H., Khan, R.A.: *Existence and numerical solutions of a coupled system of integral BVP for fractional differential equations. Adv. Differ. Equ.* 2018, 149 (2018)
9. Luo, D., Wang, J., Shen, D.: *Learning formation control for fractional-order multi-agent systems. Math. Methods Appl. Sci.* 41, 5003–5014 (2018)
10. Peng, S., Wang, J., Yu, X.: *Stable manifolds for some fractional differential equations. Non linear Anal., Model. Control* 23, 642–663 (2018)
11. Zhang, J., Wang, J.: *Numerical analysis for a class of Navier–Stokes equations*

- with time fractional derivatives. *Appl. Math. Comput.* 336, 481–489 (2018)
12. Zhu, B., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Local and global existence of mild solutions for a class of nonlinear fractional reaction–diffusion equation with delay. *Appl. Math. Lett.* 61, 73–79 (2016)
  13. Wang, Y., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Positive solutions for a non-local fractional differential equation. *Nonlinear Anal.* 74, 3599–3605 (2011)
  14. Zhang, X., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Existence results for multiple positive solutions of nonlinear higher-order perturbed fractional differential equations with derivatives. *Appl. Math. Comput.* 219, 1420–1433 (2012)
  15. Wang, Y., Liu, L., Zhang, X., Wu, Y.: Positive solutions of a fractional semi positive differential system arising from the study of HIV infection models. *Appl. Math. Comput.* 258, 312–324 (2015)
  16. Zhang, X., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Variational structure and multiple solutions for a fractional advection-dispersion equation. *Comput. Math. Appl.* 68, 1794–1805 (2014)
  17. Zhang, X., Mao, C., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Exact iterative solution for an abstract fractional dynamic system model for bioprocess. *Qual. Theory Dyn. Syst.* 16, 205–222 (2017)
  18. Zhang, X., Liu, L., Wu, Y., Wiwatanapataphee, B.: Non trivial solutions for a fractional advection dispersion equation in anomalous diffusion. *Appl. Math. Lett.* 66, 1–8 (2017)
  19. Jiang, J., Liu, L., Wu, Y.: Multiple positive solutions of singular fractional differential system involving Stieltjes integral conditions. *Electron. J. Qual. Theory Differ. Equ.* 2012, 43 (2012)
  20. Wang, J., Zhou, Y., Fekkan, M.: Nonlinear impulsive problems for fractional differential equations and Ulam stability. *Comput. Math. Appl.* 64, 3389–3405 (2012)
  21. Abbas, S., Benchohra, M., Graef, J. R., Henderson, J.: *Implicit Fractional Differential and Integral Equations: Existence and Stability*, vol. 26. de Gruyter, London (2018)
  22. Otrocol, D., Ilea, V.: Ulam stability for a delay differential equation. *Cent. Eur. J. Math.* 11, 1296–1303 (2013)
  23. Wang, J., Zhang, Y.: Ulam–Hyers–Mittag-Leffler stability of fractional-order delay differential equations. *Optimization* 63, 1181–1190 (2014)
  24. Capelas de Oliveira, E., Vanterler da C. Sousa, J.: Ulam–Hyers–Rassias stability for a class of fractional integro-differential equations. *Results Math.* 73, 111 (2018)
  25. Vanterler da C. Sousa, J., Capelas de Oliveira, E.: Ulam–Hyers stability of a



nonlinear fractional Volterra integro-differential equation. *Appl. Math. Lett.* 81, 50–56 (2018)

26. Vanterlerda C. Sousa, J., Kucche, K. D., Capelas de Oliveira, E.: Stability of  $\psi$ -Hilfer impulsive fractional differential equations. *Appl. Math. Lett.* 88, 73–80 (2018)

27. Wang, J., Zhou, Y., Fečkan, M.: Nonlinear impulsive problems for fractional differential equations and Ulam stability. *Comput. Math. Appl.* 64, 3389–3405 (2012)

28. Vanterlerda C. Sousa, J., Capelas de Oliveira, E.: On the Ulam–Hyers–Rassias stability for nonlinear fractional differential equations using the  $\psi$ -Hilfer operator. *J. Fixed Point Theory Appl.* 20, Article ID 96 (2018)

29. Shah, K., Ali, A., Bushnaq, S.: Hyers–Ulam stability analysis to implicit Cauchy problem of fractional differential equations with impulsive conditions. *Math. Methods Appl. Sci.* 41, 8329–8343 (2018)

30. Ali, Z., Zada, A., Shah, K.: Ulam stability to a toppled systems of nonlinear implicit fractional order boundary value problem. *Bound. Value Probl.* 2018, Article ID 175 (2018)

31. Khan, H., Khan, A., Chen, W., Shah, K.: Stability analysis and a numerical scheme for fractional Klein–Gordon equations. *Math. Methods Appl. Sci.* (2018). <https://doi.org/10.1002/mma.5375>